

Appendix A

Options Appraisal

Key: **Blue** = Advantages **Red** = Disadvantages **Black** = Comments and Facts

Options Appraisal								
Considerations	Save the 'Status Quo'	Changing Staffing Structure	Establish an Early Years Observation Unit	Federalisation	5 year Warranty	Establish on-site childcare provision	Open a café to contribute towards running costs	Close the School and move the children to an alternative school
1. Class Sizes	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20. Three year forecasts: 2020: 2 Classes – 3 and 4 pupils 2021: 1 class of 5 2022: 1 class of 5	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Ysgol Llanaelhaearn pupils continue to be educated in two classes - 3 pupils in the foundation phase and 5 in KS2 in 2019-20.	Pupils to be educated in more appropriate size classes. Pupils to mix daily and be educated with other children of the same age.
2. Pupil Numbers	Low numbers continues at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number. Opportunity to campaign to increase numbers.	Low numbers continue at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number. Opportunity to campaign to increase numbers.	Low numbers continues at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number. An ABC Unit does not usually attract children to the school.	Low numbers continues at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number. Opportunity to campaign to increase numbers.	School projections continue to appear fragile in number. 39 of surplus places (83%) in 2019-20 and is likely to increase according to projections. Opportunity to campaign to increase numbers.	Low numbers continues at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number. This option may attract more to the school in the future.	Low numbers continues at Ysgol Llanaelhaearn. 39 of surplus places (83%). School projections continue to appear fragile in number.	The numbers of the school that will provide education for the area more securely and sustainably for the future. Reduced surplus places in the catchment area.
4. Leadership and Staffing	The Headteacher will teach 1 day a week at Ysgol Garndolbenmaen from September 2019, which means he leads three schools over 4 days. Risk that Ysgol Garndolbenmaen could end the collaboration arrangement.	Attracting a candidate to the post of Headteacher at a school with 8 pupils could be challenging. If a Headteacher is not appointed, leaving the school without a Headteacher, it would not be possible to open the school doors. Risk of not appointing a Headteacher and losing staff in the meantime.	Additional responsibilities for Site Manager. The Headteacher will teach 1 day a week at Ysgol Garndolbenmaen' from September 2019, which means he leads three schools over 4 days. Risk that Ysgol Garndolbenmaen could end the collaboration arrangement	Save Headteacher time - federation would mean that the Headteacher can plan across the federation, rather than individual schools. Should a new Headteacher need to be recruited in the future it could make the job more attractive to applicants. A formal federation model would give a definite structure and any new would have to agree to head the 'federation'.	The Headteacher will teach 1 day a week at Ysgol Garndolbenmaen from September 2019, which means he leads three schools in 4 days. Chwilog's forecasts show an increase in numbers over the next three years, and Garndolbenmaen decreasing over the three years, so the Headteacher's learning situation is unlikely to change.	Additional responsibilities for Site Manager. The Headteacher will teach 1 day a week at Ysgol Garndolbenmaen from September 2019, which means he leads three schools over 4 days. Risk that Ysgol Garndolbenmaen could end the collaboration arrangement	Additional responsibilities for Site Manager. The Headteacher will teach 1 day a week at Ysgol Garndolbenmaen from September 2019, which means he leads three schools over 4 days. Risk that Ysgol Garndolbenmaen could end the collaboration arrangement	Alternative school numbers allowing the Headteacher to be able to lead and manage professionally at the school. Staff redundancy

Options Appraisal								
Considerations	Save the 'Status Quo'	Changing Staffing Structure	Establish an Early Years Observation Unit	Federalisation	5 year Warranty	Establish on-site childcare provision	Open a café to contribute towards running costs	Close the School and move the children to an alternative school
5. The Community	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p>	<p>Uncertainty remains regarding the sustainability of Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's education provision.</p> <p>Maintain a school presence in the village of Llanaelhaearn.</p> <p>High percentage of children attending schools outside the catchment area</p> <p>Promoting community use of the building.</p> <p>Restrict opening hours to out of school hours due to risk of mixing public and pupils without DBS checks.</p> <p>Risk of how much use of a café would there be.</p>	<p>Llanaelhaearn Village loses school.</p>
6. Financial Resources	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>As the minimum staffing protection policy allows staffing of a Headteacher and assistant, it does not cover all school staff costs, and therefore the gap must be filled by adjusting the budget.</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p>	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>Staffing costs for this model would be reduced, and would be addressed by the minimum staffing protection policy.</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p>	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>As the minimum staffing protection policy allows staffing of a Headteacher and assistant, it does not cover all school staff costs, and therefore the gap must be filled by adjusting the budget.</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p> <p>The option would not generate income.</p>	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>As the minimum staffing protection policy allows staffing of a Headteacher and assistant, it does not cover all school staff costs, and therefore the gap must be filled by adjusting the budget</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p> <p>Opportunity to make savings by sharing resources and employing staff across the federation in future appointments.</p>	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>As the minimum staffing protection policy allows staffing of a Headteacher and assistant, it does not cover all school staff costs, and therefore the gap must be filled by adjusting the budget.</p> <p>3 year budget forecast shows that the school will face a budget deficit.</p>	<p>Possibility of charging a childcare provider a fee to generate income.</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p>	<p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn remains financially unsustainable and therefore receives a sum towards staffing protection. The school has received £43,744 of additional funding in 2019/20.</p> <p>As the minimum staffing protection policy allows staffing of a Headteacher and assistant, it does not cover all school staff costs, and therefore the gap must be filled by adjusting the budget</p> <p>Ysgol Llanaelhaearn's cost per pupil average remains high (£12,671 per head) which is three times the county average.</p> <p>Potential for income generation.</p> <p>Need to invest in the kitchen to use it again.</p>	<p>Transport costs to the Authority as the alternative school is more than 2 miles from pupils' homes.</p> <p>The school will not remain in the staffing safety net.</p> <p>Reduce the cost per pupil of teaching.</p>
8. The Welsh Language	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	No change to the language situation.	Welsh-medium education offered as at present.

Options Appraisal								
Considerations	Save the 'Status Quo'	Changing Staffing Structure	Establish an Early Years Observation Unit	Federalisation	5 year Warranty	Establish on-site childcare provision	Open a café to contribute towards running costs	Close the School and move the children to an alternative school
9. Geographical Factors	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	No change No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.	Some pupils will need to travel further than they do at present. No pupil in the area will need to travel an unreasonable distance to school.
10. Other considerations	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. By ending the current arrangement of collaboration, the opportunities and experiences offered to children by visiting Ysgol Chwilog would come to an end. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school.. Increased use of building. Sacrifice learning space.	Formalize the current arrangement of collaboration and sharing of Headteacher. Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school. Lack of interest from neighbouring schools.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school. Registration process with CIW - approximately 6 months. Need to secure regular users to employ 2 staff - approximately 10 children.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Small Classes. Offer occasional experiences for pupils to socialise with other children of the same age by working with Chwilog school. Current school numbers do not allow pupils to socialise and work with peers on a daily basis to take advantage of a wide range of curricular and extra-curricular experiences. Numbers a disadvantage when pupils transfer to secondary school.	Quality of education Benefits and resources of the school. Regular experiences for pupils to socialise and collaborate with peers.

Key: **Blue** = Advantages **Red** = Disadvantages **Black** = Comments and Facts

This document was revised following the consultation period, which ended on 29 January 2020.

Comments and information presented during the consultation did not lead to an amendment in the content of this document.